

Theoretical Study, Synthesis, and Reactivity of Five-Membered-Ring Acyl Sulfonium Cations

K. V. Raghavendra Rao,^[a] Nicolas Caiveau,^[a] Rolf David,^[a] Ibrahim Shalayel,^[a] Anne Milet,^[a] and Yannick Vallée^{*[a]}

Keywords: Prebiotic chemistry / Sulfur / Cations / Alkylation / Acylation

The feasibility of the cyclization of γ -alkylthiobutyric acid derivatives to form previously unknown five-membered-ring acyl sulfonium cations was studied. Experimental results were in good agreement with our DFT calculations that predicted such cyclizations to be easy if starting with acyl iodides and mixed anhydrides of triflic acid. Particularly efficient were the reactions of γ -alkylthiobutyryl fluorides with trimethylsilyl triflate in CDCl₃ solution, which led to cyclic

Introduction

In 1993, Jakubowski^[1] reported that cyclic acyl sulfonium compound 1 was formed from methionine during tRNA aminoacylation catalyzed by *E. coli* methionyl tRNA synthetase (editing process). He stated that 1 was stable in acidic water and proposed that it could have been a possible methyl donor in the primitive ocean at a time when *S*adenosyl-methionine and folate cycles did not exist, and thus it may have played an important prebiotic role. However, the pieces of evidence presented in support of the existence of 1 were rather weak and consisted of TLC spots and the argument that the compound producing these spots reversed to methionine after basic hydrolysis. No spectroscopic data of 1 were presented, and from an organic chemist point of view, the realness of such an acyl sulfonium cation could be regarded as questionable.



In fact, acyl sulfoniums are poorly known compounds, and most of those that have already been described or proposed as intermediates are very reactive. In 1963, the intermediacy of a five-membered cyclic acyl sulfonium was pos-

[a] Département de Chimie Moléculaire, Univ. Grenoble Alpes, CNRS,

Campus, 38041 Grenoble, France E-mail: yannick.vallee@ujf-grenoble.fr

http://dcm.ujf-grenoble.fr

Supporting information for this article is available on the WWW under http://dx.doi.org/10.1002/ejoc.201500749.

acyl sulfonium triflates. In some cases, the observed acyl sulfonium salts were stable enough to be characterized by NMR spectroscopy. They were found to be both alkyl-transfer reagents and acylating agents. They react with amines to form amides. These findings lend some weight to our hypothesis that the acyl sulfonium derived from methionine may have played a major role in the prebiotic synthesis of the first peptides on the primitive Earth.

tulated by Truce and Abraham^[2] to explain the formation of a thiolactone upon heating 4-alkylthiobutyryl chlorides (i.e., the transient acyl sulfoniums were found to be readily dealkylated). In 1977, Minato et al.^[3] reported that the *S*alkylation of an aromatic thiol ester gave a sulfonium cation that was detected by ¹H NMR spectroscopy. Later, very reactive three- and four-membered cyclic acyl sulfoniums, observable only at low temperature, were described by Lebedev et al.^[4] In 2005, Kozhevnikov et al.^[5] reported the isolation of two stable solid acyl sulfonium chlorides, the stability of which was probably due to the bulky aromatic groups surrounding their sulfonium function.

We were thus intrigued by the possible existence of compound **1**. Had it existed in the primitive ocean, it could have played a role not only as a methyl donor (as proposed by Jakubowsky^[1]) but also as an activated amino acid, able to react with other amino acids to give dipeptides, in the absence of any catalyst.^[6–8]



Scheme 1. Synthesis and cyclization of acyl halides derived from acid 2. DAST = diethylaminosulfur trifluoride, $TfO = CF_3SO_3$.

SHORT COMMUNICATION

To demonstrate that five-membered-ring acyl sulfonium cations can be stable species, we study herein the synthesis of simple analogues of 1, for example 4, and demonstrate that they can be both alkylating and acylating reagents (Scheme 1).

Results and Discussion

Our DFT calculations (see Table 1, Figure 1, and the Supporting information) predicted that acyl chloride 3a and bromide **3b** should not undergo cyclization (in solution at room temperature). In contrast, we expected iodide 3c to cyclize readily to form the iodide salt of sulfonium 4. However, in this case easy dealkylation of 4 was predicted, and the probable final products would then be methyl iodide and thiolactone 5. Cyclization was also anticipated to be easy and quick with mixed anhydride 3d as the starting material. Furthermore, the stabilities of 4-triflate and 5 + MeOTf were predicted to be similar. As the activation energy for this last transformation was calculated to be quite high, we anticipated that the triflate salt of 4 could be stable.

These predictions were confirmed by our synthesis of compounds 3a-d from acid 2.^[9] As expected, 3a and 3b were found to be stable compounds, but iodide 3c (¹³C NMR: C=O at δ = 161.7 ppm), observed after treatment of 3a with TMSI (a method known to yield acyl iodides from chlorides^[11]), was unstable at room temperature in CDCl₃ solution and was transformed into methyl iodide (¹³C NMR: δ = -22.5 ppm) and thiolactone 5.^[12]

However, even if we did not observe any trace amount of MeOTf, we were unable to identify 4 as a product of

Table 1. Standard free-energy change (ΔG) and activation energy (ΔG^{\ddagger}) for cyclization and demethylation reactions.

Reaction	$\Delta G^{[a]}$ [kcal mol ⁻¹]	$\Delta G^{\ddagger [a]}$ [kcal mol ⁻¹]
$3a \rightarrow 4\text{-}Cl^-$	5.5	12.9
$3b \rightarrow 4\text{-Br}^-$	2.7	10.9
$3c \rightarrow 4-I^-$	-0.1	10.2
$3d \rightarrow 4\text{-}TfO^-$	-9.6	9.7
$4-I^- \rightarrow 5 + MeI$	-14.4	16.7
$4\text{-TfO}^- \rightarrow 5 + \text{MeOTf}$	-0.3	30.1

[a] Solvent (continuum): acetonitrile ($\varepsilon = 35.688$).^[10]

the reaction of fluoride 3e, obtained by the reaction of the corresponding acid with DAST,^[13] with Me₃SiOTf (even though the formation of Me₃SiF was clearly demonstrated by ¹H NMR, ¹³C NMR, and ¹⁹F NMR spectroscopy).^[14] In place of the singlet at about $\delta = 3.15 \text{ ppm}^{[3]}$ expected for sulfonium 4, we observed a signal at $\delta = 2.94$ ppm, not compatible with structure 4, but rather with a trialkylated sulfonium species that we were unable to identify $[Me_2S^+(CH_2)_3C(O)X?]$ but probably indicating migration of the methyl group of 4 onto a sulfide. Similar migrations will be presented later in this communication.

As 4 was not observed, we envisaged to replace the methyl substituent of 2 by bigger groups (Scheme 2). Treatment of fluoride 6 with Me₃SiOTf^[15] resulted in the formation of a new species. At room temperature, its ¹H NMR spectrum consists mainly of a series of broad signals, but at -20 °C, the spectrum is clearer and indicates the presence of a stereogenic sulfur atom.

Both the chemical shifts and the splitting of the observed signals are in agreement with structure 7 (Figure 2, a), accompanied with some thiolactone 5. In the ¹³C NMR spec-



Reaction Coordinates

Figure 1. Energy diagram for the reaction pathway from **3c** to **5** (cyclization and demethylation).



Scheme 2. Synthesis and evolution of acyl sulfonium cations.

trum, the C=O carbon atom is observed at $\delta = 187.1$ ppm. However, 7 has only a half-life of about 2 h at room temperature, and it is cleaved into 5 and cyclohexene.^[16] Under similar conditions, from 8, chosen because in this case no β elimination would be possible from the expected sulfonium cation, a new species for which we assumed structure 9 was obtained. Even though its ¹H NMR spectrum is not completely resolved, even at low temperature, chemical shifts and observable splitting patterns (Figure 3) added to the signals observed in its ¹³C NMR spectrum (C=O at δ = 187.6 ppm) made us confident that the main species in solution was 9. This was further ascertained by the synthesis of spiro derivative 11 from 10.^[17] Here, the structure is rigidified, and the lack of a β -CH₂ moiety simplifies the spectrum. Even though some impurities were present, the three AB systems expected for 11 are clearly observed at -20 °C (Figure 2, b). Compounds 9 and 11 are stable at least for days in CDCl₃ solution at room temperature.



Figure 2. ¹H NMR spectra of 7 and 11 at 253 K.

Further evidence for the existence of stable cyclic acyl sulfonium cations was obtained with aromatic analogues of



Figure 3. ¹H NMR spectroscopy study of the formation of **9** from **8** with time and at various temperatures: (a) **8**; (b) just after the addition of TMSOTf; (c) at 255 K after 1 h; (d) at 223 K; (e) at 215 K.

4. Thus, **13a** was found to be stable in CDCl₃ solution. Even methyl derivative **13b** was clearly obtained (¹H NMR: SMe at $\delta = 3.15$ ppm). However, it was accompanied by two other products that we identified as thiolactone **15**^[18] and sulfonium **14b** (¹³C NMR: C=O at $\delta = 156.4$ ppm, ¹⁹F NMR: $\delta = 27.0$ ppm; ¹H NMR: SMe₂ at $\delta = 3.07$ ppm, CH₂S at $\delta = 5.05$ ppm). The final ratio (reached after 5 h at room temp.) of **13b** and **15** was found to be about 1:1. This is an unambiguous example of a cyclic acyl sulfonium cation acting as a methyl donor. Another example of this behavior was observed if the reaction was run in the presence of dibutyl sulfide. In this case, **15** and **16b**^[19] were obtained in a nearly 1:1 ratio (a trace amount of **14b** was also present).

Similar results were obtained from 12c. However, benzyl migration was quicker than the previous methyl migration. Thus, 13c was not observed, and 14c and 15 were obtained in a 1:1 ratio. If dibutyl sulfide was present in the reaction mixture, 15 and $16c^{[20]}$ were the major products (\approx 1:1 ratio, with some amount of 14c).

Having demonstrated that acyl sulfonium cations are alkyl-transfer reagents, we tested their ability also to be acylating reagents. Indeed, the LUMO that we calculated for **4** (Figure 4) had its biggest coefficient on the carbon atom of the carbonyl group ring, a strong argument in favor of easy ring-opening reactions by nucleophilic species. Representative results with amines and amides are presented in Scheme 3.^[21] Alicyclic sulfonium cations were found to react with both types of nucleophiles, but aromatic cation **13a** was less reactive and reacted only with the amino group of phenylalanine amide. These results confirm our prediction and assumption that if methionine derivative **1** was present on the early Earth, it could not only be a methyl donor but also a good starting material for the synthesis of dipeptides. However, the stability of **1** in water is still far from certain.^[6]

SHORT COMMUNICATION



Scheme 3. Reactions of stable acyl sulfonium triflates with amines and amides.



Figure 4. Calculated LUMO for cation 4. (Left) Side view; (right) top view.

Acknowledgments

The authors thank the Laboratoires d'Excellence ARCANE (ANR-11-LABX-0003-01) for funding through a KVRR grant, L'Institut du développement et des ressources en informatique scientifique (IDRIS) (project number i214086670), and CECIC and CIMENT for providing access to computing facilities.

- a) H. Jakubowski, J. Biol. Chem. 1993, 268, 6549–6553; b) H. Jakubowski, FASEB J. 1993, 7, 168–172.
- [2] W. E. Truce, D. Abraham, J. Org. Chem. 1963, 28, 964-967.
- [3] H. Minato, T. Miura, M. Kobayachi, *Chem. Lett.* **1977**, 609–614.
- [4] M. V. Lebedev, V. G. Nenaidenko, K. I. Smolko, E. S. Balenkova, *Russ. J. Org. Chem.* 2001, 37, 326–333.
- [5] V. N. Kozhevnikov, D. N. Kozhevnikov, O. V. Shabunina, N. N. Kataeva, S. A. Yushchuk, V. L. Rusinov, O. N. Chupakhin, *Russ. Chem. Bull. Int. Ed.* 2005, 54, 2187–2196.

- [6] a) A. Milet, A. Gouron, R. David, H. Jamet, Y. Vallée, Abstracts of Papers, 246th ACS Meeting, Indianapolis, 2013, COMP-63., b) Y. Vallée, A. Milet, K. V. Raghavendra Rao, Phosphorus Sulfur Silicon Relat. Elem. 2015, DOI: 10.1080/ 10426507.2015.1034314.
- [7] The start codon is quite variable in *Escherichia coli*. Not only AUG (Met codon) but also UUG, GUG, and AUU are used. This may indicate that Met was "chosen" before the start codon: a) F. R. Blattner, G. Plunkett III, C. A. Bloch, N. T. Perna, V. Burland, M. Riley, J. Collado-Vides, J. D. Glasner, C. K. Rode, G. F. Mayhew, J. Gregor, N. W. Davis, H. A. Kirkpatrick, M. A. Goeden, D. J. Rose, B. Mau, Y. Shao, *Science* 1997, 277, 1453–1462; b) C. Sacerdot, G. Fayat, P. Dessen, M. Springer, J. A. Plumbridge, M. Grunberg-Manago, S. Blanquet, *EMBO J.* 1982, 1, 311–315.
- [8] Among the many plausible scenarios previously proposed to explain the prebiotic formation of peptides in the primitive ocean, and more broadly the appearance of life, no one attributes a specific role to methionine. See, for example: K. Ruiz-Mirazo, C. Briones, A. de la Escosura, Chem. Rev. 2014, 114, 285–366; S. Mann, Angew. Chem. Int. Ed. 2013, 52, 155–162; Angew. Chem. 2013, 125, 166–173; G. Danger, A. Michaut, M. Bucchi, L. Boiteau, J. Canal, R. Plasson, P. Robert, Angew. Chem. Int. Ed. 2013, 52, 639–642; U. Schreiber, O. Locker-Grutjen, C. Mayer, Origins Life Evol. Biospheres 2012, 42, 47–54; M. W. Powner, J. D. Sutherland, Philos. Trans. R. Soc. B 2011, 366, 2870–2877; C. G. Kurland, Bioassays 2010, 32, 866–871; J. L. Bada, Earth Planet. Sci. Lett. 2004, 226, 1–15; M.-C. Maurel, L. Orgel, Origins Life Evol. Biospheres 2000, 30, 423–430.
- [9] K. A. Williams, J. T. Doi, W. K. Musker, J. Org. Chem. 1985, 50, 4–10.
- [10] As experimental reactions were performed in deuterated chloroform, calculations with $CHCl_3$ integral equation formalism-polarizable continuum model ($\epsilon = 4.711$) were also performed for all reactions. The found activation energies and

complexes energies were similar to those calculated with acetonitrile (within 5 kcal mol⁻¹). However, separated charged species (4, Cl⁻, Br⁻, I⁻, and TfO⁻ at an infinite distance) were poorly described in implicit CHCl₃, because the scheme is mostly a function of the dielectric constant of the solvent, ε . Calculations in acetonitrile were kept for their accuracy.

- [11] A. H. Schmidt, M. Russ, D. Grosse, Synthesis 1981, 216-218.
- [12] D. Bhar, S. Chandrasekaran, *Tetrahedron* **1997**, *53*, 11835–11842.
- [13] W. J. Middleton, J. Org. Chem. 1975, 40, 574-578.
- [14] All reactions involving triflates were run in CDCl₃ solution and were followed by NMR spectroscopy. No attempts at isolating products were made.
- [15] Similar results were obtained by using Et₃SiOTf and *i*Pr₃SiOTf, as well as from the corresponding acyl chloride by using Me₃Si-OTf and Et₃SiOTf.
- [16] After some time, cyclohexyl triflate was also detected, see: S. S. C. Koch, A. R. Chamberlin, J. Org. Chem. 1993, 58, 2725– 2737.

- [17] Compound 10 was obtained in two steps from commercially available 1-(mercaptomethyl)cyclopropaneacetic acid: (1) alkylation of thiol with neopentyltriflate, (2) fluorination with DAST.
- [18] I. Ryu, T. Okuda, K. Nagahara, N. Kambe, M. Komatsu, N. Sonoda, J. Org. Chem. 1997, 62, 7550–7551.
- [19] T. J. Wenzel, J. Zaia, Anal. Chem. 1987, 59, 562-567.
- [20] D. J. Procter, M. Thornton-Pett, C. M. Rayner, *Tetrahedron* 1996, 52, 1841–1854.
- [21] Crystals of **17a** were obtained after recrystallization from ethanol. CCDC-1055644 contains the supplementary crystallographic data for this paper. These data can be obtained free of charge from The Cambridge Crystallographic Data Centre via www.ccdc.cam.ac.uk/data_request/cif.

Received: June 7, 2015 Published Online: August 20, 2015

