# Boron Nitride Nanotubes-Reinforced Glass Composites

Narottam P. Bansal,\*\*,<sup>†</sup> Janet B. Hurst,\* and Sung R. Choi\*,<sup>‡</sup>

NASA Glenn Research Center, Cleveland, Ohio 44135

Boron nitride nanotubes (BNNT) of significant lengths were synthesized by reaction of boron with nitrogen. Barium calcium aluminosilicate glass composites reinforced with  $\sim 4$  wt% of BNNT were fabricated by hot pressing. Ambient-temperature flexure strength and fracture toughness of the glass-BNNT composites were determined. The strength and fracture toughness of the composite were higher by as much as 90% and 35%, respectively, than those of the unreinforced glass. Microscopic examination of the composite fracture surfaces showed pullout of the BNNT. The preliminary results on the processing and improvement in mechanical properties of BNNT-reinforced glass matrix composites are being reported here for the first time.

## I. Introduction

ARBON nanotubes (CNT) show many properties that are superior to those of graphite. Boron nitride nanotubes (BNNT) have similar structure as CNT and exhibit many similar properties. Pure BNNTs were first synthesized using a plasma arc discharge method yielding mainly double-walled BNNTs or by a CNT substitution reaction giving multiwalled BNNTs. Many other approaches, such as pyrolysis over cobalt, chemical vapor deposition, laser ablation, and reactive milling, have been tried for the synthesis of BNNTs with varying degrees of success. BNNTs show interesting mechanical, electrical, and thermal properties. Pure CNTs show metallic or semiconducting behavior depending on composition, diameter, and chirality. On the other hand, BNNTs are semiconductors with a band gap of 4-5 eV. BNNTs are potential candidate materials for a large variety of nanosized electronic and photonic devices. CNTs oxidize in air at 400°-600°C and burn completely by 700°C, limiting their high-temperature applications. On the other hand, BNNTs show stability<sup>1</sup> in air at 700°C. Some nanotubes with perfect cylindrical structure may be stable<sup>1</sup> up to 900°C. BNNTs are, therefore, more suitable as reinforcement for composite materials for applications at elevated temperatures in oxidizing environment.

A number of studies are currently available on metal, ceramic, and polymer matrix composites reinforced with CNTs as seen from the recent review articles.<sup>2–6</sup> However, to the best of our knowledge, until now, no results have been published on the subject of BNNTs-reinforced composites. The objective of this work was to improve the strength and fracture toughness of a solid oxide fuel cell (SOFC) seal glass<sup>7</sup> by reinforcing with BNNT. Ambient-temperature mechanical properties including flexure strength and fracture toughness of glass-BNNT composite were determined. The results on the processing and mechanical properties of BNNTs-reinforced glass matrix composites are being reported here for the first time.

## **II. Experimental Procedures**

BNNTs were synthesized in-house at NASA Glenn Research Center. Amorphous boron powder was mixed with several weight percent of fine iron catalyst particles in a hydrocarbon solvent and ball milled in a polythene bottle using ceramic grinding media. The milled material was applied to various high-temperature substrates such as alumina, silicon carbide, platinum, and molybdenum and reacted in a flowing atmosphere of nitrogen containing a small amount of ammonia. Nanotubes of significant length and abundance were formed on heat treatments at temperatures from 1100° to 1400°C for 20 min to 2 h. The resulting product consisted of a mixture of NTs and particulates of BN. Batch sizes of typically 2 g were produced, but the process should be easily scalable to larger amounts.

For composite processing, a barium calcium aluminosilicate (BCAS)<sup>7</sup> glass powder of composition (mol%) 35BaO-15CaO-5Al<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub>-10B<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub>-35SiO<sub>2</sub> or 56.4BaO-8.8CaO-5.4Al<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub>  $-7.3B_2O_3$ -22.1SiO<sub>2</sub> (wt%) with an average particle size of 14.2 µm was used. This glass composition labeled as G-18 has a glass transition temperature of 619°C, dilatometric softening point of 682°C, and coefficient of thermal expansion  $10.5 \times 10^{-6}$ °C<sup>-</sup> (from room temperature to 500°C) and  $11.8 \times 10^{-6}$ °C<sup>-1</sup> (20°-800°C). BCAS glass composites reinforced with  $\sim 4 \text{ wt\%}$  of assynthesized BNNTs were fabricated.<sup>8</sup> Appropriate quantities of BCAS glass and BNNT were mixed in acetone, and ball milled for  $\sim$  24 h using zirconia milling media. Acetone was evaporated and the powder dried in an electric oven. The resulting mixed powder was loaded into a graphite die and hot pressed in vacuum at  $630^{\circ}$ C under 10 MPa for 15 min into 50 mm  $\times$  25 mm plates using a mini hot press. The applied pressure was released before onset of cooling. Glass powder without any BNNT was also hot pressed at 630°C. Grafoil was used as spacers between the specimen and the punches.

The hot-pressed plates were machined into flexure bar test specimens with nominal depth, width, and length of 2.0 mm  $\times$  3.0 mm  $\times$  25 mm, respectively. The final finishing was completed with a #500 diamond grinding wheel under the specified conditions in accordance with ASTM standard C1161.<sup>9</sup> Machining direction was longitudinal along the 25 mm length direction. The sharp edges of test specimens were chamfered to reduce any spurious premature failure emanating from those sharp edges.

Strength testing was conducted in four-point flexure at ambient temperature in air. A test fixture with 10 mm inner and 20 mm outer spans was used in conjunction with an electromechanical test frame (Model 8562, Instron, Canton, MA). A stress rate of 50 MPa/s was applied in load control using the test frame. A total of 10 test specimens were tested. One of two 3 mm wide sides of each test specimen was subjected to maximum tension or compression. Although the specimen configuration

F. Zok-contributing editor

Manuscript No. 20788. Received July 19, 2005; approved July 27, 2005.

This work was supported by Low Emission Alternative Power (LEAP) and Alternate Energy Foundation Technology (AEFT) Programs, NASA Glenn Research Center, Cleveland, OH. \*Member, American Ceramic Society.

<sup>\*\*</sup>Fellow, American Ceramic Society.

Author to whom correspondence should be addressed. e-mail: narottam.p.bansal@

nasa.gov <sup>‡</sup>Present address: University of Toledo, Toledo, OH.



Fig. 1. Field emission scanning electron microscope micrographs of boron nitride nanotubes.

was different, in general, testing was carried out in accordance with the ASTM test standards C 1161.9

Fracture toughness was determined using the flexure bar test specimens at ambient temperature in air using the single-edge v-notched beam (SEVNB) method.<sup>10</sup> The same technique was previously used to measure fracture toughness of G18 glass and G18 glass composites reinforced with alumina or zirconia.<sup>8</sup> This method utilizes a razor blade with diamond paste, with grain size of 9  $\mu$ m, to introduce a final sharp notch with a root radius ranging from 10 to 20  $\mu$ m by tapering a saw notch. The sharp v-notched specimens with a notch depth of about 1.0 mm along the 3 mm wide side of test specimens were fractured in a fourpoint flexure fixture with 10 mm inner and 20 mm outer spans using the Instron test frame (Model 8562) at an actuator speed of 0.5 mm/min. Three specimens were tested. Fracture toughness was calculated based on the formula by Srawley and Gross.<sup>11</sup>

Morphology of the BNNTs, microstructures of polished cross-sections of hot-pressed composites, and fracture surfaces of specimens after strength measurements were observed in a





**Fig. 2.** Field emission scanning electron microscope micrographs of polished cross-section of G18 glass composite reinforced with 4 wt% boron nitride nanotubes.

 

 Table I.
 Strength and Fracture Toughness of G18 Glass and Composite Reinforced with 4 wt% BNNTs

	Property	
Materials	Flexure strength (MPa)	Fracture toughness $(MPa \cdot m^{1/2})$
Glass G18 Glass G18-BNNT composite	$48 \pm 7$ $0.51 \pm 0.03$	$92 \pm 17 \\ 0.69 \pm 0.09$

BNNT, boron nitride nanotube.

Hitachi S4700 (Hitachi High Technologies America, Inc., Pleasanton, CA) field emission scanning electron microscope (FE-SEM) equipped with a super-thin window EDAX Genesis System (EDAX, Inc., Mahwah, NJ) energy-dispersive spectrometer (EDS).

## III. Results and Discussion

FESEM micrographs of the BNNTs synthesized at NASA Glenn are shown in Fig. 1. BNNTs having diameter of 10–40 nm and of significant lengths (tens of micrometers) are observed. The NTs were found to consist of nearly stoichiometric BN. BN particles were also seen to be present in some areas.

Typical FESEM micrographs showing polished cross-sections of the G18 glass reinforced with BNNTs are shown in Fig. 2. The NTs are dispersed homogeneously in the matrix. From EDS analysis, it was found that the black regions consist of BN and the white particles were zirconia, most probably introduced as impurities during ball milling. Results of flexure strength testing for the G18 glass-BNNT composite are presented in Table I. Strength of G18 glass<sup>8</sup> is also shown for comparison. The addition of just 4 wt% of BNNT increases the glass strength from  $48\pm7$  to  $92\pm17$  MPa. This 90% increase in strength of the glass with BNNT reinforcement is notable, compared with a moderate strength increase (40%-60%) for G18 glass reinforced with 5 mol% alumina platelets or zirconia particulates.<sup>8</sup> Weibull strength distributions of the glass and BNNT-reinforced glass composite are presented in Fig. 3 despite insufficient number of test specimens used. Weibull modulus (m) ranged from 7 to 8, indicating the same degree of scatter in strength (or flaw population) for both the glass and the BNNT-glass composite. FESEM micrographs showing typical fracture surfaces of flexure-strength-tested specimens of G18 glass reinforced with 4 wt% BNNTs are shown in Fig. 4. Limited amount of pullout of the NTs is observed as indicated by arrows. Troughs resulting from pullout of the NTs can also be seen in Fig. 4.



**Fig. 3.** Weibull strength distribution of G18 glass reinforced with 4 wt% boron nitride nanotubes. The Weibull data for G18 glass are also included for comparison<sup>8</sup>; *m* is the Weibull modulus and  $\sigma_{\theta}$  is the characteristic strength.



Fig. 4. Field emission scanning electron microscope micrographs showing typical fracture surfaces of flexure-strength-tested specimens of G18 glass reinforced with 4 wt% boron nitride nanotubes. Pullout of nanotubes is indicated by arrows.

The results of fracture toughness testing by the SEVNB method are given in Table I. Fracture toughness shows a similar trend as strength. However, the increase in fracture toughness was less significant than strength. The addition of just 4 wt% of BNNTs increases the fracture toughness  $(K_{Ic})$  of glass from BINN 1s increases the fracture toughness  $(1_0)$  = 0.51 $\pm$ 0.03 to 0.69 $\pm$ 0.09 MPa · m<sup>1/2</sup>. This 35% increase in fracture toughness for the glass-BNNTs composite is comparable with that for the G18 glass composites reinforced with similar amounts of alumina or zirconia.<sup>8</sup>

Limited availability of the BNNTs-reinforced glass composite did not allow the evaluation of R-curve behavior or crack growth resistance of the composite material in the current study. However, it should be mentioned that the G18 glass reinforced with alumina platelets or zirconia particulates has exhibited a rising R-curve, with its degree being increased with increasing content of the reinforcement.8 Crack bridging and/or crack defection<sup>12</sup> was considered to be a major strengthening or toughening mechanism operative for those composites.<sup>8</sup> A similar mechanism may also be attributed to a possible R-curve and the increase in strength and fracture toughness of the glass composite reinforced with BNNTs, as seen from Fig. 4.

Because of their small size and large aspect ratio, CNTs are considered to be highly promising reinforcement materials as the energy dissipation during crack propagation can be greatly enhanced because of pullout. A few studies are available on the SiC,<sup>13</sup> alumina,<sup>14-16</sup> and glass matrix<sup>17</sup> composites reinforced with CNTs. Improvements in strength and fracture toughness of silica glass<sup>17</sup> and alumina<sup>14</sup> by the addition of 5%-10% of CNTs have been reported earlier. However, Peigney et al.<sup>15</sup> and Flahaut et al.16 failed to observe any beneficial effect on the mechanical properties of alumina from the addition of long CNT bundles.

The work presented in this paper has been done primarily for the purposes of the fabrication of glass-BNNT composites and the determination of their ambient-temperature mechanical properties. However, SOFCs operate in a typical temperature range of 700°-1000°C, so that thermal and mechanical properties and environmental durability of the glass composites need to be evaluated at elevated temperatures, as done previously for 10-YSZ composites.<sup>18</sup> Needed work includes constitutive rela-tion (viscosity)/sealability,<sup>19</sup> coefficient of thermal expansion, intermediate-temperature strength, thermal fatigue, life-limiting factors, and stability of material including crystallization,<sup>7</sup> etc. Results of detailed investigations of this glass-BNNT composite system will be reported in the near future.

#### IV. Conclusions

A BCAS glass composite containing 4 wt% BNNTs was fabricated by hot pressing. Reinforcement with BNNTs improved both the flexure strength and fracture toughness of the glass. The strength of the composite was higher by as much as 90% and fracture toughness by as much as 35% than those of the glass. Microscopic examination of the fracture surfaces showed pull out of the NTs. The results on the processing and improved mechanical properties of BNNTs-reinforced glass matrix composites are being reported here for the first time.

#### Acknowledgments

The authors are grateful to Dan Gorican for assistance during processing of BNNTs, Ralph Pawlik for mechanical testing, and John Setlock for composite fabrication.

#### References

<sup>1</sup>Y. Chen, J. Zou, S. J. Campbell, and G. Le Caer, "Boron Nitride Nanotubes: Pronounced Resistance to Oxidation," *Appl. Phys. Lett.*, **84** [13] 2430–2 (2004). <sup>2</sup>W. A. Curtin and B. W. Sheldon, "CNT-Reinforced Ceramics and Metals,"

Mater. Today, 7 [11] 44-9 (2004). <sup>3</sup>P. J. F. Harris, "Carbon Nanotube Composites," Int. Mater. Rev., 49 [1] 31-45

(2004).

<sup>4</sup>H. D. Wagner and R. A. Vaia, "Nanocomposites: Issues at the Interface," Mater. Today, 7 [11] 38-42 (2004).

<sup>5</sup>E. T. Thostenson, Z. Ren, and T. W. Chou, "Advances in the Science and Technology of Carbon Nanotubes and their Composites: A Review," Comp. Sci. Technol., 61 [13] 1899-912 (2001).

6E. T. Thostenson, C. Li, and T. W. Chou, "Nanocomposites in Context: A <sup>o</sup> Comp. Sci. Technol., 65 [3-4] 491-516 (2005). Review.

<sup>7</sup>N. P. Bansal and E. A. Gamble, "Crystallization Kinetics of a Solid Oxide Fuel Cell Seal Glass by Differential Thermal Analysis," J. Power Sources, 147 [1-2] 107-15 (2005).

<sup>8</sup>S. R. Choi and N. P. Bansal, "Mechanical Properties of SOFC Seal Glass Composites," Ceram. Eng. Sci. Proc., 26 [4] 275-83 (2005).

ASTM C 1161 "Test Method for Flexural Strength of Advanced Ceramics at Ambient Temperature"; in Annual Book of ASTM Standards, Vol. 15.01. American Society for Testing & Materials, West Conshohocken, PA, 2004.

<sup>10</sup>J. Kübler, "(a) Fracture Toughness of Ceramics Using the SEVNB Method: Preliminary Results," Ceram. Eng. Sci. Proc., 18 [4] 155-62 (1997); (b)"Fracture Toughness of Ceramics Using the SEVNB Method; Round Robin"; VAMAS Report No. 37, EMPA, Swiss Federal Laboratories for Materials Testing & Research, Dübendorf, Switzerland, 1999. <sup>11</sup>J. E. Srawley and B. Gross, "Side-Cracked Plates Subjected to Combined Di-

rect and Bending Forces"; pp. 559-79 in Cracks and Fracture, Edited by J.L. Swedlow and M.L. Williams. ASTM STP 601, American Society for Testing and Materials, Philadelphia, 1976. <sup>12</sup>K. T. Faber and A. G. Evans, "Crack Deflection Processes," *Acta Metall.*, **31** 

[4] 565–76 (1983). <sup>13</sup>R. Z. Ma, J. Wu, B. Q. Wei, J. Liang, and D. H. Wu, "Processing and Properties of Carbon Nanotubes-Nano SiC Ceramic," J. Mater. Sci., 33, 5243-6 (1998).

<sup>14</sup>R. W. Siegel, S. K. Chang, B. J. Ash, J. Stone, P. M. Ajayan, R. H. Doremus, and L. S. Schadler, "Mechanical Behavior of Polymer and Ceramic Matrix Nanocomposites," Scripta Met., 44, 2061-4 (2001).

<sup>13</sup>A. Peigney, Ch. Laurent, E. Flahaut, and A. Rousset, "Carbon Nanotubes in Novel Ceramic Matrix Nanocomposites," *Ceram. Int.*, **26**, 677–83 (2000).

<sup>16</sup>E. Flahaut, A. Peigney, Ch. Laurent, Ch. Marliere, F. Chastel, and A. Rousset, "Carbon Nanotube-Metal-Oxide Nanocomposites: Microstructure, Electrical

Conductivities and Mechanical Properties," *Acta Mater.*, **48**, 3803–12 (2000). <sup>17</sup>J. Ning, J. Zhang, Y. Pan, and J. Guo, "Fabrication and Mechanical Properties of SiO2 Matrix Composites Reinforced by Carbon Nanotube," Mater. Sci.

Eng., A357, 392–6 (2003).  $^{18}\rm{S.}$  R. Choi and N. P. Bansal, "Flexure Strength, Fracture Toughness, and Slow Crack Growth of YSZ/Alumina Composites at High Temperatures," J. Am. *Ceram. Soc.*, **88** [6] 1474–80 (2005). <sup>19</sup>B. M. Steinetz, N. P. Bansal, F. W. Dynys, J. Lang, C. C. Daniels, J. L. Palko,

and S. R. Choi, "Solid Oxide Fuel Cell Seal Development at NASA Glenn Research Center"; Presented at the 2004 Fuel Cell Seminar, San Antonio, TX, November 1-5, 2004; Paper No. 148, 2004.